Mentoring Across Differences

2009 LEAD Conference

Cathy A. Trower, Ph.D.
Harvard University
Graduate School of Education

Origin of Mentor

- Mentor was the son of Alcumus and, as an old man, friend of Odysseus, in whom he entrusted his son and palace when he left to fight the Trojan War.

- Over time, the word mentor has come to mean, in addition to trusted friend, counselor or teacher, a more experienced person.

Effective Mentoring

- Is instructive and developmental (Thomas)
- Is instrumental (Moody) occurs when a senior colleague:
  - Takes time to critique the work
  - Nominates for career-enhancing awards
  - Includes in valuable networks and circles
  - Collaborates on research or teaching
  - Arranges for chairing conference sessions or manuscript submission

David Thomas (2001). The truth about mentoring minorities: Race matters, *Harvard Business Review* 79(4): 99-107.

JoAnn Moody (2004). Supporting women and minority faculty, *Academe* 90(1): 47-52.

Difference

- Social identity theory (Tajfel & Turner, 1985)
  - People classify themselves into categories

- Similarity and attraction theory (Byrne, 1971)
  - People tend to be attracted to people who appear most similar on salient demographic characteristics

- Social identification in organizations (Ashforth & Mael, 1989)
  - A) perception of oneness within the group
  - B) categorizations of people; prestige of the group; salience of outgroups
  - C) leads to activities congruent with the group's identity, stereotypical perceptions of self and others and is reinforcing

For these references, please see last slide

White males and everybody else

- Mentoring across difference not a natural act
- Four major obstacles: (Thomas, 2001)
    - Negative stereotypes
    - Difficulty identifying with the other person
    - Protective hesitation
    - Fear or skepticism of intimacy

David Thomas (2001). The truth about mentoring minorities: Race matters, *Harvard Business Review* 79(4): 99-107.

Formal Mentoring

- Legitimizes/authorizes relationships that might not occur naturally but are vitally important to both parties
- Allows institutions to:
  - Reward outstanding mentors
  - Adjust their work
  - Establish clear guidelines and parameters
  - Monitor its effectiveness

Informal Mentoring is Crucial

Junior faculty say informal mentoring is <u>more important</u> to their success than formal mentoring

	All	Males	Females	Whites	Native American	Asian/ PI	African American	Hispanic/ Latino/a
Informal	4.44	4.33	4.57 +	4.44	4.28	4.36 -	4.60 +	4.42
Formal	3.97	3.82	4.16 +	3.91	4.12	4.13 +	4.31 +	4.12 +

Scale: 1 to 5
1 = Very unimportant, 2 = Somewhat unimportant; 3 = Neither important nor unimportant;
4 = Somewhat important; 5 = Very important

+ Statistically significantly <u>more</u> important; - Statistically significantly <u>less</u> important
Males compared to females; each racial/ethnic group compared to whites

Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education, (COACHE)
2009 Highlights Report @ www.coache.org

Informal Mentoring is Crucial

Junior faculty say informal mentoring is <u>more effective</u> than formal mentoring

	All	Males	Females	Whites	Native American	Asian/ PI	African American	Hispanic/ Latino/a
Informal	3.56	3.54	3.59	3.56	3.23 -	3.56	3.57	3.59
Formal	2.90	2.88	2.91	2.82	2.57	3.23 +	2.98 +	3.04 +

Scale: 1 to 5
1 = Very unimportant, 2 = Somewhat unimportant; 3 = Neither important nor unimportant;
4 = Somewhat important; 5 = Very important

+ Statistically significantly <u>more</u> important; - Statistically significantly <u>less</u> important
Males compared to females; each racial/ethnic group compared to whites

Steps/Guidelines

1. Discuss and determine mentoring approaches
   - Dyads, committee/team, networked, multi-tiered

2. Select and assign mentors/teams
   - Those who have the time, skills, desire

3. Train and support mentors
   - Importance of mentoring
   - Unconscious bias
   - Appropriate Q&A for mentors and mentees
   - Mentor and mentor role descriptions
   - Documentation of time and evaluation of process

Cathy Trower (2007). Effective faculty mentoring report, produced for University of Pennsylvania now available @
http://www.upenn.edu/provost/images/uploads/Trower.pdf

Steps/Guidelines (continued)

4. Train and support mentees
   - Orientation, workshops, brown bags, seminars
   - Mentee handbook

5. Establish formal mentoring program policies
   - How senior admin is involved
   - How high quality is ensured across units
   - How the issues of women and minorities will be addressed
   - How departments can monitor workload and junior faculty progress towards tenure

6. Monitor and evaluate mentoring programs
   - Process evaluation
   - Outcome evaluation
   - Mentor-mentee documentation

References

Ashforth, Blake E. & Fred Mael (1989). Social identity theory and the organization, *Academy of Management Review*, 14(1): 20-39.

Byrne, Donn (1971). *The Attraction Paradigm*. New York: Academic Press.

Tajfel, Henri & John Turner (1985). The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In S. Worcehl & W.G. Austin (Eds.), *Psychology of Intergroup Relations* (2nd edition, p. 7024).